NISO JATS Standing Committee Recommendations in Response to Comments to on NISO Z39.96-2012 through August 2013

November, 2013

1. Introduction

The NISO JATS Standing Committee has completed reviewing the first round of requests for changes to the Standard. This report documents the requests made for changes to ANSI/NISO Z39.96-2012 through the end of August, 2013 and the recommendations of the Standing Committee with respect to each of those requests.

At least once a quarter the Standing Committee will review all requests that have been submitted to date and publish recommended responses to the requests. Once a year the Standing Committee will submit a revised Standard to NISO for approval.

The recommendations in this document:

- have not been submitted to NISO, and
- have not been approved for incorporation in the Standard.

Thus, any tools and supporting materials based on these recommendations must be considered drafts.

For the convenience of users who want to implement this draft, the Standing Committee will:

- publish recommendations on all of the change requests to date (in this document)
- provide, as a convenience to users, draft versions of the unofficial supporting material that incorporates the recommended changes. This will include draft:
    - DTDs, XSDs, and RNGs
    - Tag Libraries
    - XML catalogs

Key: The following Tag Set icons appear with each suggested change to indicate to which of the Tag Sets a change will apply (*Scope*):

A Archiving   **A** Article Authoring

P Publishing

2. Comment List

Comment 00250: Add Affiliation Identifier

Submitter Comment:

Please create a new element <aff-id> for use inside Affiliation (<aff>).

The element <contrib-id> is used to hold ORCIDs or other contributor identifiers used to disambiguate contributors. We do the same with affiliations, so that a single institution can be identified, whether listed as "Ova" or "University of Virginia", or a specific UVa campus.
We would like a place to store that ID.

Submitter Proposed Solution:

We request that:

1. The <institution-id> element be added to JATS to satisfy this request.

2. That this new element be used within, at least, the mixed-content model of the Affiliation (<aff>), <institution>, and <funding-source> elements.

Standing Committee Recommendation

- Create a new element <institution-id>, which can hold either a publisher-specific identifier or an identifier from an established system of institutional identifiers.

- Place attributes on the identifier to specify: the source of the identifier (such as "AIP", "Ringgold", or "ISNI"); the language of the identifier; and other attributes similar to those currently used on <contrib-id>.

- Document that both institutions and <institution-id>s are hierarchical, and may exist at several levels, such as a University and a particular department or laboratory. For example, the same lab can be part of multiple institutions. A single affiliation may require several institution ids. Describe this situation and give simple as well as complex examples.

- Create a new element <institution-wrap> that can hold an <institution> element and all its identifiers (<institution-id>). This element will be allowed everywhere <institution> is currently allowed.

- JATS will not add a generic identifier at this time.

- The element <institution-wrap> will be added to the content of the following elements:
    - conf-sponsor
    - std-organization

- The elements <institution> and <institution-wrap> will be added to the content of the following elements:
    - copyright-holder
    - funding-source
    - on-behalf-of
    - publisher-name

- No change will be made to the following elements, as they can already contain a <contrib-id> element:
    - contrib
    - principal-award-recipient
    - principal-investigator

Comment 00251: Make attributes for <isbn> like those for <issn>

Submitter Comment:
Request: Please make the attributes for <isbn> more like those for <issn>. Get rid of @pub-type (which is now deprecated in favor of @publication-format) and add @content-type.

Discussion: Here are the current <isbn> attributes:
pub-type CDATA #IMPLIED
specific-use CDATA #IMPLIED

Here are the requested <isbn> attributes:
publication-format CDATA #IMPLIED
content-type CDATA #IMPLIED
specific-use CDATA #IMPLIED

Submitter Proposed Solution:
We request that:

1. @publication-format and @content type attributes be added to <isbn>

2. The @pub-type attribute be retained, although it may be deprecated.

Standing Committee Recommendation

- Both <issn> and <isbn> will take the following attributes: @publication-format, @content-type, and @specific-use. All three attributes will be defined as data characters and optional (CDATA, #IMPLIED).

- The <issn> element will retain the @pub-type attribute, for backwards compatibility reasons.

- The attributes for the linking issn will not be changed.

- The @pub-type attribute will be deprecated everywhere. Deprecation implies: calling the attribute deprecated in the text, removing the attribute from all examples, and showing the alternative attributes (@publication-format plus @date-type) for all examples.

Comment 00252: New places for <kwd-group>

Submitter Comment:
> Request: I'd like to request that the <kwd-group> element be added to additional locations in the next revision of JATS.

Submitter Proposed Solution:
We request that the <kwd-group> be added to
- app
- app-group
- boxed-text
- chem-struct-wrap
- disp-formula
- disp-formula-group
- fig
- fig-group
- graphic
- media
- sec (keywords but not abstract present in current Tag Set)
- statement
- supplementary-material
- table-wrap
- table-wrap-group

Standing Committee Recommendation

- Keywords will be added to the following elements:
    - ack
    - app
    - app-group
    - bio
    - boxed-text
    - chem-struct-wrap
    - disp-formula
    - disp-formula-group
    - fig
    - fig-group
    - graphic
    - media

- notes
- statement
- supplementary-material
- table-wrap
- table-wrap-group

- Include examples that illustrate keywords used for mobile apps on sections (<sec>) and on figures (<fig>)for searchability.

- These changes will *not* be made to the Authoring Tag Set.

Comment 00253: New places for

Submitter Comment:

Request: I'd like to request that the element be added to additional locations in the next revision of JATS.

Submitter Proposed Solution:

We request that the be added to
- app
- app-group
- boxed-text
- chem-struct-wrap
- disp-formula
- disp-formula-group
- fig
- fig-group
- graphic
- media
- sec (keywords but not abstract present in current Tag Set)
- statement
- supplementary-material
- table-wrap
- table-wrap-group

A P

Standing Committee Recommendation

- Abstracts will be added to the following elements:
  - ack
  - app
  - app-group
  - bio
  - boxed-text
  - chem-struct-wrap
  - disp-formula
  - disp-formula-group
  - fig
  - fig-group
  - graphic
  - media
  - notes
  - sec
  - statement
  - supplementary-material
  - table-wrap
  - table-wrap-group

- The following changes will be made in the non-normative documentation:
  - Document a clear distinction between and the accessibility elements (<alt-text> and <long-desc>).
  - Document a clear distinction between the abstracts for document components and the abstract in <article-meta> that represents the entire article.
- These changes will *not* be made to the Authoring Tag Set.

Comment 00254: Fixed roman, fixed italic, fixed case

Submitter Comment:

Discussion: I notice that the element <roman> is documented for use to make mark up text in roman script "no matter what style the surrounding text takes on", whereas <italic> is documented explicitly as acting as a "toggle" to change italicization depending on the context.

My questions are:
(a) Is there a mechanism to mark up "always italic"?
(b) Is there a mechanism to mark up "fixed case" (i.e., hypothetically, "<fixed-case>pH</fixed-case>")?

Discussion: (some?) emphasis elements should act as toggles. Or is it just italic?

I think this is acceptable for a generic emphasis element, but may be problematic when content (an inline formula symbol, for example) should be rendered italic no matter what. Making authors use MathML for those symbols is a thing that is hard to enforce.

Standing Committee Recommendation

- The attribute @toggle (values "yes" and "no") will be placed in all of the emphasis class elements (which can include: bold, italic, monospace, overline, roman, sans-serif, sc, strike, and underline).
- On most of these elements, the default value will be optional (#IMPLIED). On <italic>, which JATS has documented as a toggle, the default value will be "yes". On <roman>, which JATS has documented as fixed, the default value will be "no".
- Create a new <fixed-case> element to be allowed anywhere face markup is allowed. This element is not a toggle and will take the attributes @specific-use and @content-type.

Comment 00255: Table Cell Content

Submitter Comment:

1) Allow nested tables [that is, a inside a table cell] and
2) Allow block-level content inside a table cell <td> as an alternative to inline content.

Background: In list-items, block-level content is mandatory, while in table cells, only inline content may appear. Apart from this perceived inconsistency, it is important for our customer to be able to put multiple paragraphs or lists into a cell. This may be alleviated by the fact that lists are permitted within <td> content. We have identified a single introductory paragraph with a subsequent list as the most common multiple-block-level situation within cells. So one could argue that the model already permits this. On the other hand, a list between paragraphs may be rendered differently (with more vertical space around it) than an embedded list, for a reason (lists that continue a paragraphs sentence vs. list items that contain entire sentences).

If you want to avoid the default HTML <td> or CALS <entry> model of "both inline and block-level content allowed, but only one of them in a single cell" and rather opt for either inline-only or block-level-only, I'd argue for block-level-only.

[More information concerning our implementation:] In most cases, a HoBoTS document can easily be transformed into a BITS document: If you have paragraphs in table cells, you can unwrap their contents and

place a break in between. You won't be able to preserve indentation and vertical spacing, but this is acceptable. If you have tables in table cells, you can wrap them in named-content.")

Since <array> is available in side table cells now, this request is really for a paragraph element (<p>) inside a table cell.

Submitter Proposed Solution:

We recommend that:

The paragraph element (<p>) be added inside table cells, since we see a clear semantic and processing need for this.

Please be aware that:
1. This request calls for the mixing of paragraph and #PCDATA, which the NISO JATS tag sets have never done (however, other block-level structures including array are already allowed in this context).

2. The other XHTML models can handle <p>, but the CALS extensions should be checked.

3. The original limitation was due to the inability of software to handle <p> inside table cells. The Standing Committee should investigate the current state of the software.

Standing Committee Recommendation

- The Standing Committee denies the request to allow nested tables (element <table-wrap>) inside a table cell. We believe that <array> handles the need.

- The Standing Committee denies the request to allow only block-level content inside table cells.

- The paragraph element <p> will be added to the contents of table cells, to allow both #PCDATA mixed content and block-level objects inside table cells. This will allow both <break> and <p> inside table cells and should meet the need of the request for block-level content in table cells without making current JATS documents invalid.

Comment 00256: Add Ruby tagging

Submitter Comment:

Request: SPJ would like to propose coding ruby as is defined in HTML5.

Background: SPJ would like to propose just one more idea, regarding coding Japanese language articles, especially humanity science articles. They often use ruby, that expresses pronunciation of Chinese characters which almost always have more than one, often several, different pronunciations. The use of ruby is defined in HTML5 uses <ruby> and <rt>. See:
http://dev.w3.org/html5/spec/Overview.html#the-ruby-element

• We would like to propose introducing a ruby tag, much like the bold or underline tags, as follows.

<ruby>多武峰<rt>とうのみね</rt><ruby>
or
<rubigrp>多武峰<rubi>とうのみね</rubi></rubigrp>

This will be useful not only for Japanese but also European users who want to code index/pronunciation expression for non-English words in body texts.

Submitter Proposed Solution:

We recommend that this solution be added to JATS. Please note that there may be a need for Ruby in contributor names.

![APA logos]

Standing Committee Recommendation

- The Ruby Base tag <rb> will be added to allow the narrative text that will be annotated with Ruby to be demarcated explicitly.

- We chose not to include the Ruby Parenthesis element <rp>, which is a workaround for non-HTML5 compliant browsers. (see also 00288 and 00289).

- We allow <ruby> anywhere in the narrative text that face markup is allowed. (see also 00288 and 00289).

Comment 00257: @id for top-level elements/@id-everywhere

Submitter Comment:

Request: the addition of @id attribute to <front>, <body>, and <back>.

Background: In constructing http://www.lib.umich.edu/mpach , we will be storing JATS (and potentially BITS) documents — plus embedded media, supplemental material, and optionally a user-provided typeset PDF — with a METS "wrapper" in the HathiTrust repository. HathiTrust METS files include a <structMap> pointing to the salient structural features of the digital object (each identified with a unique ID), which allows for traversal of the item in the interface. We want to be able to point not only to each <sec> but also to <front> and to any text in a <body> or a <back> which might lack <sec>s inside it.

Request: Consider adding IDS to all elements.

Background: Frankly, we think it would be best to make @id a global attribute. We feel that you can't really decide in advance what use cases users will have for putting an @id on an element, even if that element can only occur once according to the DTD. We, for example, also need IDs for fulltext indexing purposes so that all #PCDATA within a JATS/BITS document has a parent element with an ID.

Submitter Proposed Solution:

We recommend that @ids be added to all the big structural parts of document, such as <front>, <body>, and <back>.

Please note: The documentation needs to make a clear distinction between XML-type-IDs (used for internal linking within the boundaries of a single XML document) and elements which may contain a real world identifier such as a DOI or ORCID.

![APA logos]

Standing Committee Recommendation

- Add the @id attribute to all elements in each Tag Set.
- Document clearly the distinction between @id attribute values, which are internal document identifiers used by software to perform a simple link, and identifier elements (such as <contrib-id> and <article-id>), which are part of the metadata for a document and hold as their content externally defined identifiers such as an ORCID personal identifier.
- Change the prose name of the @id attribute to "Document Internal Identifier".

Comment 00258: Parameter Entity for Global Attributes (RDFa)

Submitter Comment:

Request: Please add a parameter entity for global attributes. We wish to allow formatting (CSSa) and semantic (RDFa) markup in attributes.

Background: This leads to another wish: we currently patch each element that is allowed to carry an @xml:lang attribute in the following way:

```
<define name="sec-atts" combine="interleave">
<ref name="css_attributes"/>
<ref name="Rdfa.attrib"/>
</define>
```

If there were a parameter entity for global attributes in the DTD (which may default to @xml:lang), it would be easier to add orthogonal, attributes-based vocabularies.

RDFa is intended for marking up multiple-choice tests and the like. We'd prefer not to use JATS-style content-type attributes for that because RDFa is more expressive and we can use the same vocabulary in HoBoTS and in HTML (where we'll probably have Javascript widgets that turn RDFa-enriched books into interactive test applications).

We use CSSa for conveying the original InDesign style information and local formatting overrides, after translating them into CSS properties and attaching them as XML attributes. One reason for using CSSa is that we want to be able to express formatting that should appear in the
same way in every rendering. For example, we can just pass thru the properties for handwriting fonts – css:font-family="cursive", extra spacing after paragraphs – css:margin-bottom="12pt", font color – css:color="device-cmyk(0,1,1,0)", or table cell backgrounds – css:backgroundcolor=" device-cmyk(0,0,0,0.2)". They will find their way to the HTML and EPUB renderings almost unaltered – except that they'll translate into CSS rules or HTML style attributes, and except that color values will be converted to RGB.

Submitter Proposed Solution:
The BITS Working Group forwards this to JATS for a response.

Standing Committee Recommendation

- Add a parameter entity to hold global attributes (named "jats-common-atts") and add this parameter entity to the attribute list of each element in the Tag Sets. For now, the only content of this parameter entity will be the @id attribute. This new parameter entity will enable users to customize the NISO JATS Tag Sets by adding attributes such as @xml:lang, CSS classes, and RDFa attributes to all elements.

  This parameter entity addition must be done in such a way that duplication warnings for the @id attribute do not occur. This will require changes to current attribute list parameter entities. Thus, while the new parameter entity will cause no existing NISO JATS documents to break, it may break customizations. Document this clearly for existing users.

- In recognition of the fact that the @id attribute, although optional for most elements, is required for some elements, this request will be implemented using two parameter entities: one for common attributes where the @ID attribute is optional and one for common attributes where the @id attribute is required:
  - common-atts
  - jats-common-atts-id-required

- Additionally, the global attributes will not be placed onto the <mml:math> element.

- The global attributes will be placed on to the table elements for both the XHTML-inspired table models and the CALS-based OASIS Exchange table model.

Comment 00259: MathML 3.0

Request: We have been asked by a typesetting house to relay a request to the JATS maintenance list to support MathML 3.x in JATS:

http://www.w3.org/TR/MathML3/
http://www.dessci.com/en/products/mathplayer/tech/mathml3.htm

Background: Apparently, some clients of theirs use this newer version of MathML and it proves a serious limitation to them that JATS does not inherently support it. Note that MathML 3 is backwards compatible with MathML 2, but there is less support available for it yet.

Discussion: Mulberry has added MathML 3.0 to JATS for a client. The module replacements are very simple, but it does disclose an interesting problem. BITS/JATS uses a class/mixes system, and names all its parameter entities accordingly: "list.class", "emphasis.class', "product.class", et al. The new MathML 3.0 DTD has a very different naming schema, but it now (unlike MathML 2.0) includes ".class' parameter entities. Sure enough, "product.class" is an overlap, which would fail silently, since the BITS/JATS libraries are called in before those of MathML.

The temporary solution: In coordination with a few members of the W3C MathML Committee, we hacked the MathML DTD code, since this problem does not alter the MathML Tag Set at all and only happens in the DTD-based version, not occurring in the XSD version.

Standing Committee Recommendation

- The next release of the standard will replace MathML 2.0 with MathML 3.0.

- For backwards compatibility, the non-normative DTDs will be made available with MathML 2.0. Looking to the immediate future, the non-normative DTDs will also be made available with MathML 3.0.

- We realize that this increases the number of DTDs available, and we will publish a decision chart or similar in the documentation to guide users.

Comment 00260: Rename Parameter Entities

Submitter Comment:

Should we rename all the JATS parameter entities to avoid problems like the one just discussed for MathML (http://www.niso.org/apps/org/workgroup/jats-sc/view_comment.php?comment_id=258)? This will not change the ANSI/NISO spec, but would be completely backwards incompatible with all previous versions of BITS/JATS. It would amount to a pseudo-namespace prefix (prefix only) on all of the parameter entities.

Submitter Proposed Solution:

This is a very complex issue. The BITS Working Group forwards this request to the JATS Standing Committee for a response.

Standing Committee Recommendation

- For this release, change the name of the parameter entity that clashes with NISO JATS in the MathML 3.0 module. This issue will be revisited at the next full (not dot) release.

Comment 00261: XML Catalog Files

Submitter Comment:

Request:
Before using the JATS DTD files from <ftp://ftp.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pub/jats/publishing/1.0/jats-publishing-dtd-1.0.zip>, I have to edit the catalog-jats-v1.xml file and empty all the xml:base attributes, which are originally set as either

"file:///C:/Work/Tasks/DTDJournal/"
or

"file:///C:/Work/Tasks/Common/".

Would it be possible to publish the DTDs with empty xml:base attributes?

Discussion:
[Commenter_1]: I agree with Commenter_2] that the xml:base attributes in the catalog files are a problem. I think it would be better that they be removed, that the current "test" catalogs be distributed as the official ones. Without the xml:base attributes, if someone is working with one particular flavor of JATS, all that person has to do is point their tool to the catalog file, and everything works out-of-the-box, which is as it should be.

Unfortunately there is another problem with the catalog files, and that is that each one lists all of the resources in the entire JATS suite, rather than just those resources in the one flavor that that catalog file goes with. In other words, there is only one master catalog file, named catalog-jats-v1.xml, a copy of which is distributed with each JATS flavor. So, for example, the catalog file in the archiving distribution includes an entry for the publishing-flavor resource "JATS-journalpubcustom-mixes1.ent".

What this means is that if a person has two or more flavors of JATS on her system, in different directories, then these catalog files will not work without the xml:base attributes. But note, of course, that she would still need to go in and adjust the values of these attributes to match her particular system setup. So I don't think this is a good reason for keeping the xml:base attributes.

The reason for doing it this way, from what I can tell, is to support the use-case where someone unzips all of the DTDs into one directory. The filenames of all of the .dtd and .ent files are unique, but the catalog filenames are not, so if you unzip two or more DTDs into one directory, you end up with only one catalog file. Note that in this use case, it would also be better if the catalog files did not have xml:base attributes.

I've recommended before that the catalog files should be fixed by removing the xml:base attributes and removing any resources that don't correspond to that particular flavor of JATS. This would allow most people to use the catalog files out-of-the-box, and would support the use cases:

* downloading and using only one flavor of JATS
* downloading several flavors, each into their own directory.

If the use case "download several flavors all into one directory" is really important, I think there is a better way to support it, too: rename the flavor-specific catalog files to catalog-archiving.xml, catalog-publishing.xml, etc., and then create a catalog-master.xml (or just catalog.xml), that is the same in all of the directories, that looks like this:

<catalog xmlns="urn:oasis:names:tc:entity:xmlns:xml:catalog" prefer='public'>
<nextCatalog catalog="catalog-archiving.xml"/>
<nextCatalog catalog="catalog-publishing.xml"/>
<nextCatalog catalog="catalog-articleauthoring.xml"/>
</catalog>

A **P** *A*

Standing Committee Recommendation

- Exactly two OASIS XML Catalog Specification-cased catalog files will continue to be made available with each new JATS release. These files will be renamed to be (where "n" below represents the current version number):
    - catalog-jats-vn-with-base; and

- catalog-jats-vn-no-base

- The @xml:base provided in the catalog that contains @xml:base will be made even more obviously a fake exemplar than it is now, using something similar to "replace-with -a-real-base".

- Comments within the catalog files will be expanded to make it obvious which files are used only by a single Tag Set, such as Archiving, and which are used (or potentially used) in all the Tag Sets. Make it clear that if you are using only one Tag Set, you may delete the files which are specific to the other Tag Sets. Remind users that unused files in an XML catalog do not cause problems.

Comment 00262: Typo in description of Mixed Citation

Submitter Comment:

I'm writing to make you aware of a potential error. In the description for Mixed Citation, the paragraph that starts with "Historical Note:" refers to JATS 3.0 - Shouldn't it be JATS 1.0?

http://jats.nlm.nih.gov/publishing/tag-library/1.0/n-3u40.html"

Standing Committee Recommendation

- The NLM DTD/JATS version numbering is complicated and confusing. In the text of the JATS documentation, all references to previous versions of the JATS or NLM DTDs will be replaced with text similar to "in previous versions of this Tag Set".

Comment 00263: clarifying meaning of "inside the document metadata"

Submitter Comment:

The definition of <supplementary-material> has a usage note that says the element is used "inside the document metadata as an alert to the existence of supplementary material so that such material can be accessed from the document". A user wrote on jats-list on 2013-01-21 that he took "inside the document metadata" to mean "inside <back>", but I think we mean "inside <article-meta>".

Submitter Proposed Solution:

We should clarify as intended.

When I wrote "definition", I think I meant the Tag Libraries. It's not in the PDF on the NISO website but instead at http://jats.nlm.nih.gov/publishing/tag-library/1.0/?elem=supplementary-material .

Standing Committee Recommendation

- References to "metadata" and "document metadata" throughout the JATS documentation will include the parenthetical (<article-meta>), to indicate what is meant. Minor rewording may also be necessary.

Comment 00264: cross references to <inline-supplementary-materials>

Submitter Comment:

In the tag libraries, I find no mention of <inline-supplementary-material> in the following places where I would expect it:

* the "Related Elements" note in the spec for <inline-graphic>
* the "Related Elements" note in the spec for <graphic>
* the "Tagging Figures, Graphics" page (under "Common Tagging Practice")

There may be others.

I suggest adding mentions.

Standing Committee Recommendation

- The Standing Committee drafted new text for the definitions and remarks of both <supplementary-material> and <inline-supplemenary-material>.

Comment 00266: Archiving non-normative documentation: @pub-id-type value "pii"

Submitter Comment:
In the Archiving Set Tag Library, the suggested value "pii" on @pub-id-type includes the following:

A more generic "pii" defined as "publisher's internal identifier" is used by some archives, for example, PubMed Central, to mark "any internal reference identifier that has been assigned by the publisher".

PMC has ceased using "pii" in favor of "publisher-id".

Submitter Proposed Solution:
I'm requesting:
1: The description of "pii" in the Archiving Tag Set be updated to match that used in both the Publishing and Article Authoring Tag Sets which just reads "Publisher Item Identifier."

2: The value be identified as deprecated in the documentation for all 3 Tag Sets

Unless the next change will be non-backward compatible, in which case I'd like to request that the value be removed from the enumerated lists in Publishing (article-id, pub-id) and Authoring (pub-id).

Standing Committee Recommendation

- The following text will be removed from the JATS documentation, as PMC has ceased using "pii", replacing it with "publisher-id":

 A more generic 'pii' defined as 'publisher's internal identifier' is used by some archives, for example, PubMed Central, to mark 'any internal reference identifier that has been assigned by the publisher'.

- The "pii" value will be removed from any tagged examples.

- The value "pii" will be removed from any lists of suggested values.

Comment 00267: Definition of element def-item

Submitter Comment:
<def-item> is defined as:
Container element for one term/definition pair in a definition list

As container is defined in Section 6: Definitions: "An element that contains one or more of the same element or several related elements," I believe that <def-item> in Archiving can be either container or a wrapper, but in Publishing and Authoring it is a wrapper element.

I'd like to request that the committee reconsider the definition of <def-item>

Submitter Proposed Solution:
Other sections: 9.4.73, 10.4.60

Standing Committee Recommendation

- The definition for the term "container element" in the NISO Standard list of terms will be replaced to indicate that a "container element" is an XML term-of-art, merely indicating that one element is inside another, typically a parent/child relationship but perhaps ancestor/descendent.

- Definition for <def-item> will read, "One item in a definition (two-part) list."

Comment 00268: Deprecate *-count elements

Submitter Comment:

Since a generic <count> item is available in the Suite, I'd like to request that the individual *-count items be identified as deprecated:
equation-count
fig-count
page-count
ref-count
table-count
word-count

Standing Committee Recommendation

- Replacing specific elements such as <fig-count> with the generic <count> element identified by attribute values would be very disruptive at this time, so this request is denied.

- Documentation should make it clear that the current generic <count> element is not to be used for elements, such as a figure, whose count can be recorded by specific count elements, such as <fig-count>.

- The entire issue of specific elements versus generic elements will be revisited for the next major non-backwards-compatible release.

Comment 00269: Expand definition of <year>

Submitter Comment:

The definition of <year> is:
Numerical, 4-digit year.

This seems an inadequate definition since @calendar was added to accommodate non-Gregorian years.

Submitter Proposed Solution:

Please expand the definition of the year element.

Standing Committee Recommendation

- The definition of <year> will read, "Representation, usually numerical, of a calendar year."

- An <era> element will be added to all date-like models, such as <date>, <date-in-citation>, and <pub-date>.

- The @iso-9601-date attribute will be defined as:

"A machine-processable, ISO 8601 formatted date value ("YYYY-MM-DDThh:mm:ss") for a JATS date-specific element, whether date be specified as text, an ISO date, a partial date, or as any other date format. If the date *given in the content of the element* is in a non-Gregorian calendar, this attribute will hold the Gregorian calendar equivalent of that date."

Comment 00270: Request to support Table and Figure labels in multiple languages

Submitter Comment:

Articles in some journals have tables where the table caption is in both Portuguese and English, and the label appears in both languages, too. While the caption can be tagged in both languages, as in:

```
<table-wrap>
<label>Tabela 1</label>
<caption>
<p xml:lang="pt">Escala de valores da Análise de Processo Hierárquico</p>
<p xml:lang="en">Scale of values Analysis of Hierarchic Process</p>
...
</table-wrap>
```

There is no way to add the label in a second language.

See http://floram.org/files/v20n1/v20n1a04.pdf for an example.

A P A

Standing Committee *Recommendation*

- The Standing Committee decided that the use case(s) motivating this request were unclear. No action will be taken at this set of changes to the Standard.

Comment 00271: Show Repeating Structures in Samples when allowed

Submitter Comment:

A JATS user required people submitting JATS documents to them to wrap each <subject> in a <subj-group>, not allowing multiple <subject>s in a <subj-group> because the samples in the Tag Library don't show any <subj-group>s with more than one <subject>. Even after I pointed out that the model allows <subject> to repeat, they insisted that this might be OK by the model but was discouraged in practice, based on the samples.

Submitter Proposed Solution:

Show samples with repeating structures when appropriate.

A P A

Standing Committee Recommendation

- Examples of repeating structures will be added to the non-normative documentation.

Comment 00272: add <xref> as possible child of <on-behalf-of>

Submitter Comment:

I am increasingly seeing the need to allow <xref> inside <on-behalf-of>, when the on-behalf-of has a footnote anchor, like this:

<on-behalf-of>the MANTRA Investigators<xref ref-type="fn" rid="fn1-2048872612471213">*</xref></on-behalf-of>

Example PDF is attached in comment system.

Submitter Proposed Solution:

Allow <xref> inside <on-behalf-of>.

P A

Standing Committee Recommendation

- The element <xref> will be added to the content of <on-behalf-of>.

Comment 00273: Add a new element <code>

Submitter Comment:

We request that NISO JATS add a <code> element. The <preformat> element is becoming semantically overloaded and does not quite meet our needs.

Background:

In current ANSI/NISO JATS, the <preformat> element is used to hold program code and scripts, pseudo-code, man-machine dialogs, error codes and messages, ASCII art, shape poetry, in fact any text that needs spacing preserved.
It is frequently abused for small bits of text that might more properly be taggedas an array. It can contain almost anything.

We currently use <preformat @preformat-type="code"> to handle our computer language samples. But we would prefer to have an explicit <code> element.

<preformat> is oriented towards display, with the following attributes:
- id (unique identifier)
- orientation (portrait or landscape for displays
that care, such as print)
- position (floating or fixed in the display)
- preformat-type (type such as "code" or "poetry")
- specific-use (why or how used)
- xml:lang (what human language)
- xml:space (keep tabs and spaces)

In addition to predeclaring the semantics, we would like <code> to have at least the following additional attributes:

- code-type
- code-version
- executable (yes | no)
- language (meaning computer language such as JAVAScript)
- language-version (of the computer language)
- platforms (on which platforms do you intend this to run)
- code-version

The usage we envision is an alternatives grouping containing 3 executables (for various platforms), an ASCII version for simple display, and a syntax-colored version (by one of the popular syntax-coloring programs) for fancy display.

Standing Committee Recommendation

- Element <code> will be added to the Tag Suite

- The element <code> will be allowed inside the element <alternatives>.

- The element <inline-code> will not be added to the Suite.

- The definition, related elements, and attributes for this new block element were accepted as proposed.

Comment 00275: Could JATS allow the xml:base attribute?

Submitter Comment:

This comment stems from a discussion on GitHub, at https://github.com/elifesciences/lens/issues/6, in which the concern was raised that there's no standard way to find a figure (for example) that corresponds to an article, when retrieving the article XML from the publisher's website (or PMC, for that matter).

JATS includes the xlink:href attribute, which, in the tag library, is specified as "An address or identifier that permits an XLink application to find a remote resource, for example, a URI". But in the XLink specification, this *must* be a URI, and "if the URI reference is relative, its absolute version must be computed by the method of [XML Base] before use." In other words, XLink specifies how to determine the absolute URI from this attribute value.

Of course, whether a publisher or anyone else would "honor" that absolute URI, by making it dereferenceable, and providing the requested resource there, is a separate question.

But the problem is that JATS doesn't provide any means for a provider of articles in JATS XML to specify how to resolve relative URIs, even if they wanted to, because it doesn't allow the xml:base attribute. If JATS were to allow this attribute, it would provide a means for publishers to declare the canonical URL for the document, and an unambiguous way to resolve xlink:href attribute values.

I'd also suggest that the definition of xlink:href attribute in JATS should be changed to specify that it *must* be a URI, rather than "for example, a URI". URIs (absolute and relative) provide all the needed semantics, but have important constraints (for example, on allowed characters). Specifying that they must be a URI would simplify the burden on processing tools, and help interoperability. (As mentioned before, the question of whether the URI is dereferenceable is a completely separate issue, so saying this value must be a URI doesn't impose any extra burden on anyone in that regard.)

Standing Committee Recommendation

- Add the attribute @xml:base to every element in the Tag Suite.

- Update non-normative documentation for @xlink:href to include reference the W3C XLink recommendation which states that the value must be a URI.

Comment 00276: Add <contrib-group> to <on-behalf-of>

Submitter Comment:
> using 2013-05-31 "add <xref> as possible child of <on-behalf-of>" (Comment 00272) as an example, if we are referring to a footnote that leads to a list of members of that group, we would want to be able to pass that list of investigators onto PubMed, so it would be useful to capture these at this level as per <collab>.

Submitter Proposed Solution:
> include <contrib-group> as child of <on-behalf-of>

Standing Committee Recommendation

- The elements <institution> and <institution-wrap> will be added to the content of <on-behalf-of>.

- The elements <contrib> and <contrib-group> will not be added to the content of <on-behalf-of>.

Comment 00277: Archival Only: Add ids to trans-abstract

Submitter Comment:
> In the Archiving Tag Set, the element abstract contains an optional repeatable id element, but the element trans-abstract does not. I suggest adding an optional repeatable id element to trans-abstract.

Standing Committee Recommendation

- Add @id to <trans-abstract>.

Comment 00280: Misleading description of @xml:lang - z39.96-2012.pdf

Submitter Comment:

The following paragraph is misleading on a few points:

###

Typical values are described by the IETF RFC 5646, two-letter, lower-case language codes such as "fr" (French), "en" (English), "de" (German), and "zh" (Chinese). These values are NOT case sensitive, but current best practice uses all lower case. Values can be obtained from the IANA Language Subtag Registry: http://www.iana.org/assignments/language-subtag-registry.

###

RFC 5646 should be used to construct the value of @xml:lang, which RFC 5646 calls a "language tag". Each language tag consists of subtags for the primary language, extended language, script, region, etc.

Submitter Proposed Solution:

Revise to something like the following:

The value of this attribute must conform to IETF RFC 5646 (http://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc5646). For most uses, a primary-language subtag such as "fr" (French), "en" (English), "de" (German), and "zh" (Chinese) is sufficient. These values are NOT case sensitive, but current best practice uses all lower case. However, the value of the attribute may contain other subtags as well. Values for the various subtags (which can be used in certain combinations) can be obtained from the IANA Language Subtag Registry: http://www.iana.org/assignments/language-subtag-registry.

Standing Committee Recommendation

- The definition of @xml:lang will read, "The value of this attribute must conform to IETF RFC 5646 (http://tools.ietf.org/html/rfc5646). For most uses, a primary-language subtag such as "fr" (French), "en" (English), "de" (German), and "zh" (Chinese) is sufficient. These values are NOT case sensitive, but current best practice uses all lower case. However, the value of the attribute may contain other subtags as well. Values for the various subtags (which can be used in certain combinations) can be obtained from the IANA Language Subtag Registry: http://www.iana.org/assignments/language-subtag-registry."

Comment 00281: Funder identifier tagging

Submitter Comment:

With the advent of CrossRef's FundRef project, We're looking at ways to represent funding information in JATS so that it can be provided to CrossRef. The pertinent tagging (from the example at <http://help.crossref.org/#fundref>)
is:

```
<fr:program name="fundref">
<fr:assertion name="funder_name">ABC Inc.
<fr:assertion name="funder_identifier">
http://dx.doi.org/10.13039/ABC Inc.
</fr:assertion>
</fr:assertion>
<fr:assertion name="award_number">BXDFSDS</fr:assertion>
</fr:program>
```

It appears that the JATS <funding-group> and <award-group> elements can map to some of the FundRef

elements -- for example,

funding-source => fr:assertion name="funder_name"
award-id => fr:assertion name="award_number"

However, there doesn't appear to be a JATS element that maps to <fr:assertion name="funder_identifier">. It's been suggested that <named-content content-type="funder-id"> might be used to capture the information.

Perhaps this is something that might be addressed in the next iteration of the DTD?

Standing Committee Recommendation

- The new elements <institution-wrap> and <institution-id> (see Comment 00250 above) are an acceptable solution for this request.

  To create the Cross-ref submission:
  1) the whole funding-source could map to fr:assertion name="funder_name"

  OR (if the tagging is more granular):

  2) funding-source/institution could map to fr:assertion name="funder_name"
  3) funding-source/institution-id could map to fr:assertionname="funder_identifier"

Comment 00287: Add string-date to <mixed-citation> in Blue

Submitter Comment:
I have following reference that I want to tag in JATS Blue:

Murphy TP, Byrne DP, Curtin P, Baker JF, Mulhall KJ. Can a periarticular levobupivacaine injection reduce postoperative opiate consumption during primary hip arthroplasty? Clin Orthop Relat Res. 2012 Apr;470(4):1151-7. Epub 2011 Sep 30

Note that is has two dates:

* "2012 Apr" - the date of print publication
* "Epub 2011 Sep 30" - the epub date

My preferred model to tag citations is mixed-citation. I can easily use <year> and <month> for the first date, but would like to tag the second one, too, instead of leaving it as PCDATA. My options are:

* <date> - doesn't allow PCDATA for "Epub"
* <year>, <month>, <day> - doesn't allow semantically identifying as an epub date
* <date-in-citation> - documented as "A element should not be used to record the publication date (use)."

Solution: I'd like to request that <string-date> be added to JATS 1.1 Blue so that it can be used in the mixed-citation element. I am not recommending that it also be added to element-citation.

Submitter Proposed Solution:
Add string-date to mixed-citation in Blue

P

Standing Committee Recommendation

- The element <string-date> will be added to <mixed-citation>.

Comment 00288/289: Where to implement the Ruby tag

Submitter Comment:

When implementing the <rb> tag, I recommend that it may appear any places where face markup is allowed, not only in the body text and references but also in article title tags such as <title> and <xxx>, abstract tags, and keyword tags, but shall not appear in the contributor information. This is because has and which are able to describe alternative expressions which is required in other areas.

Standing Committee Recommendation

- The element <ruby> will be added anywhere face markup is allowed, not merely in the article narrative body, but also in metadata elements such as and <kwd>.

- The element <rp> will be added to the content model of Ruby in the Archiving model, to allow capture of existing <rp> elements.

Comment 00291: Add a new <emphasis> tag: correction

Submitter Comment:

Emphasizing is quite typical in Japanese writings as well as some Asian writings such as Korean and Chinese. These play the same role as "boldfaces" and "italics" do in roman alphabets.

Submitter Proposed Solution:

I propose adding a new tag which will describe various emphasizing functions other than boldfaces and italics. may have attributes, @xml:lang, @emphasis-style, @emphasis-type, and @toggle.

@emphasis-type may have values such as "sesami", "dot" , "circle", "triangle" or "line".(http://help.blogpark.jp/archives/52325017.html)

Although Japanese have many more styles, there are no differences in meaning, only for typesetting preferences.

@emphasis-style may have values such as "emphasis", "correction", "taxonomy", etc.

Standing Committee Recommendation

- No generic <emphasis> element will be added to the Tag Sets since the <styled-content> element already allows the requested capability.

- To make sure that <styled-content> can handle anything such a generic emphasis would need, we add the following attribute to <styled-content>:
    - @toggle

- The element <styled-content> already has the following attributes, which we feel covers all of this request:
    - @style
    - @style-type
    - @alt
    - @specific-use
    - @xml:lang

==